

350 Fifth Avenue, 34<sup>th</sup> Floor  
New York, NY 10118-3299  
Tel: +1-212-290-4700  
Fax: +1-212-736-1300; 917-591-3452

Kenneth Roth, *Executive Director*

**DEPUTY EXECUTIVE DIRECTORS**

Michele Alexander, *Development and Global Initiatives*  
Carroll Bogert, *External Relations*  
Iain Levine, *Program*  
Chuck Lustig, *Operations*  
Bruno Stagno Ugarte, *Advocacy*

Emma Daly, *Communications Director*  
Peggy Hicks, *Global Advocacy Director*  
Dinah PoKempner, *General Counsel*  
James Ross, *Legal and Policy Director*

**DIVISION AND PROGRAM DIRECTORS**

Brad Adams, *Asia*  
Daniel Bekele, *Africa*  
Alison Parker, *United States*  
José Miguel Vivanco, *Americas*  
Sarah Leah Whitson, *Middle East and North Africa*  
Hugh Williamson, *Europe and Central Asia*

Joseph Amon, *Health and Human Rights*  
Shantha Rau Barriga, *Disability Rights*  
Peter Bouckaert, *Emergencies*  
Zama Coursen-Neff, *Children's Rights*  
Richard Dicker, *International Justice*  
Bill Frelick, *Refugees' Rights*  
Arvind Ganesan, *Business and Human Rights*  
Liesel Gertholtz, *Women's Rights*  
Steve Goose, *Arms*  
Graeme Reid, *Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, and Transgender Rights*

**ADVOCACY DIRECTORS**

Philippe Bolopion, *Crisis Advocacy and United Nations, NY*  
Maria Laura Canineu, *Brazil*  
Kanae Doi, *Japan*  
Jean-Marie Fardeau, *France*  
John Fisher, *United Nations, Geneva*  
Meenakshi Ganguly, *South Asia*  
Lotte Leicht, *European Union*  
Sarah Margon, *Washington DC*  
David Mepham, *United Kingdom*  
Wenzel Michalski, *Germany*  
Elaine Pearson, *Australia*

**BOARD OF DIRECTORS**

Hassan Elmasry, *Co-Chair*  
Joel Motley, *Co-Chair*  
Wendy Keys, *Vice-Chair*  
Susan Manilow, *Vice-Chair*  
Jean-Louis Servan-Schreiber, *Vice-Chair*  
Sid Sheinberg, *Vice-Chair*  
John J. Studzinski, *Vice-Chair*  
Michael G. Fisch, *Treasurer*  
Bruce Rabb, *Secretary*  
Karen Ackman  
Jorge Castañeda  
Tony Elliott  
Michael E. Gellert  
Hina Jilani  
Betsy Karel  
Robert Kissane  
David Lakhdir  
Kimberly Marteau Emerson  
Oki Matsumoto  
Barry Meyer  
Joan R. Platt  
Amy Rao  
Neil Rimer  
Victoria Riskin  
Graham Robeson  
Shelley Rubin  
Kevin P. Ryan  
Ambassador Robin Sanders  
Javier Solana  
Siri Stolt-Nielsen  
Darian W. Swig  
Makoto Takano  
John R. Taylor  
Amy Towers  
Peter Visser  
Marie Warburg  
Catherine Zennström

Mme. Mutabar Tadjibaeva  
Square Brassens 7  
91600 Savigny sur Orge  
France  
mutabartadjibaeva@gmail.com



HRW.org

Sent via post and email.

New York, November 13, 2017

Dear Mme. Tadjibaeva,

We have completed a detailed review of the various complaints you have sent us, commencing in April of 2017 and continuing until earlier this month, relating to our Central Asia researcher Steve Swerdlow.

You have sent us many communications and publications in the interim. We realize that you feel deeply aggrieved, and we were very sad to see that you have been harshly attacked in the media for many years.

However, having reviewed all of your allegations and documents in detail, and having conducted further research, we have found these allegations to be unsupported. We are satisfied that Mr. Swerdlow has behaved professionally, using good judgment as a human rights researcher. We note also that he has in the past supported your work and spoken well of you to many, including potential donors. Our organization has for many years worked with you and recognized you as an important figure in the struggle for human rights in Uzbekistan, and has taken your recommendations and views on human rights matters in Uzbekistan into account.

Many of your allegations concern the conduct of third parties. It is not the role of Human Rights Watch to review or mediate disagreements within the human rights community of Uzbekistan or elsewhere. We will work with partners who share our commitment to standards of professionalism, accuracy and courtesy. Our mission is to address serious violations of human rights, and we encourage other activists to do so as well, rather

than weaken our mutual cause with internal quarrels. We believe that Mr. Swerdlow fully shares this view and conveys it to others.

We are glad that you felt you could come to us with these concerns, and we have done our best to take them seriously and inquire diligently.

However, we have been disappointed to see that you have shared baseless accusations about Mr. Swerdlow in inflammatory language with many others. We also must note our dismay that you appear to have recorded others and publicized their personal information and communications without their consent. These actions violate basic professional ethics and are, under many circumstances, unlawful.

Throughout this period, you have been sending various communications to Mr. Swerdlow, sometimes of an accusatory and derogatory nature. From the inception of this investigation, we had asked Mr. Swerdlow not to communicate with you. We now ask that you not make further attempts to communicate with him.

Please direct any communications that relate to human rights issues to Mr. Hugh Williamson, who is the director of the Europe and Central Asia Division of Human Rights Watch. Mr. Williamson is happy to engage with you on issues of human rights in Uzbekistan, and can be reached at [hugh.williamson@hrw.org](mailto:hugh.williamson@hrw.org).

With this letter, our review of this matter is formally closed.

Best wishes,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Dinah PoKempner". The signature is fluid and cursive, with the first name "Dinah" being more prominent and the last name "PoKempner" written in a similar style.

Dinah PoKempner